

Translation Problems of YouTube Auto Translation of Johnny Harris' "Why Indonesia is always Erupting"

Thomas Aquino Amadeus Sindhunata¹⁾, Priska Meilasari²⁾

^{1,2)} English Language Study Program, Faculty of Communication Science,
Widya Mandala Surabaya Catholic University

Email: thomasnino.29@gmail.com, priska.meilasari@ukwms.ac.id

ABSTRACT

The advance of technology has eased human's work in almost all field of jobs including in the field of translation. The traditional translator fully used their translation skills in transferring the messages of original language to the targeted language. Nowadays, by the existence of translation technology, translator could pose as a reviewer of the translation product done by the translation machine. One of the media which serves automated translation is YouTube. YouTube auto translation is analyzed in this research by looking at the problems which might occur when audience accessed it. This is a qualitative research which try to explain the nature of the data descriptively. The data are taken from Johnny Harris' YouTube video „Why Indonesia is always Erupting“. Thirteen data of possible problems occur in YouTube auto translation are explained in result and discussion section of the paper.

Keywords: Youtube auto translation, translation, machine translation, translation problems

1. INTRODUCTION

When watching movies at the theatre or home, the one thing that we always notice is the subtitle. The subtitle is a textual translation of a movie's monologues and dialogues. The subtitle in movies is located at the bottom of the screen so the audience can watch the movie without much interruption. It is usually in another language and is targeted toward the people who do not speak the language in the movie. According to Karamitraoglou (2000), subtitling is the translation of the spoken (written) source text of an audio-visual product into a written target text which is added onto the images of the original product at the bottom of the screen. Meanwhile, Gustin & Aveline (2015) defines subtitling as the transcription of film or TV dialogue that is used to help the target audience in understanding a movie which appears continuously at the bottom of the screen. In today's condition, subtitle can be easily found at the bottom of the screen product like movie, TV show, cartoon, and news delivered in foreign language. It is ultimately true that subtitle aims at helping audience to understand the dialogue from those screen products by delivering the translation in their native language. The subtitle is a great way to reach international audiences because it translates the movie's monologues and dialogues.

In this digitized era, it is easier for people to watch movies. One of the applications to watch movies is YouTube. YouTube is a social media where content creators upload videos ranging from educational videos to entertainment videos. One of the content creators that upload educational videos is Johnny Harris. Johnny Harris once worked for Vox. He used to create Vox Borders videos where he made documentaries about the current issues around the

globe. However, when the pandemic hit in 2020, Johnny Harris left the company due to the international travel restriction during the Covid-19 pandemic. After leaving the company, he created his own channel named after his own name, Johnny Harris. He has been creating documentaries about things around the world. One of the documentaries he made is ‘Why Indonesia is always Erupting’. In the video, Johnny Harris describes why Indonesia has a lot of active volcanoes and why they constantly erupt. Sadly, even though the video is about Indonesia, Johnny does not provide official Indonesian subtitles in the video, forcing Indonesian people who do not understand English to use the auto-generated translation provided by YouTube itself.

YouTube auto translation is one of the products of translation technologies which practically help translator in enhancing the efficiency, speed or quality of some of the translation process and the results. It is in line with Alcina’s (2008) point of view who said that translation technology deals with the design and adaptation of strategies, tools and technological resources that make the translator’s job easier as well as facilitating the research and teaching of such activities. On the other hand, Hutchin and Somers (1992) approach the field from the perspective of the degree of automation of the translation as well as the human engagement in employing technology to make a translation. They therefore divide this field into three (3) categories: fully automated, high-quality translation; machine-assisted translation; and machine-assisted translation with human assistance. High-quality fully automated translation is referred to as fully automated translation. This indicates that the translation process requires no involvement from humans at all. The term "machine-aided human translation" refers to the translation process in which a human translator uses a machine. The process of pre-translated and edited SL by humans is known as "human-aided machine translation," of which YouTube's AT and GT are examples. Therefore, YouTube auto translation analyzed in this study can be categorized as human-aided machine translation because YouTube viewers could suggest the translated version of the auto translation product given by YouTube.

One of the researches concerning subtitles was done by Fauliyah (2012). The researcher discussed addressing terms translation in the movie “Ketika Cinta Bertasbih II”. Fauliyah concludes that the target readers could understand the meaning but certain information such as formality, hierarchy, and honorific that carried by the term is lost. Therefore, the translators should notice differences in each address term since both Indonesian and English use different form of addressing term that is influenced by each culture. Fitria (2015) also conducted a research concerning translation technique of English to Indonesia subtitle in Doraemon “Stand by Me” movie. Fitria concludes that the most dominant type of translation technique is Established Equivalence. in translation quality assessment, it can be found that in accuracy, the higher scale is accurate, there are 239 data or 66, 39 %. In acceptability, the higher scale is acceptable, there are 233 data or 64, 72 %. In readability, the higher percentage is readable, there are 260 data or 72, 22 %. Therefore, the researcher concludes that the translation quality of “Stand By Me” Doraemon movie is accurate, acceptable and readable.

The mistranslations created by the auto-generated translation feature provided by YouTube and the absence of previous research concerning YouTube auto generated translation spark the researcher’s interest to analyse the translation accuracy of the auto-generated

translation feature. Therefore, this research seeks to find out the accuracy level of YouTube auto translation.

2. RESEARCH METHOD

The data analysed for this study was derived from an educational documentary video entitled 'Why Indonesia is always Erupting' by Johnny Harris. The writer collected the educational documentary video from the YouTube website since YouTube provides a full and official version of the educational documentary video with an Indonesian auto-generated translation. The writer focused on the translation accuracy of the Indonesian auto-generated translation feature provided by YouTube. However, to limit the analysis, the writer only selected the inaccurate English-to-Indonesian translation to be discussed in this paper.

After watching the YouTube video entitled "Why Indonesia is always Erupting", the writer writes down the inaccurate translation made by auto generated translation feature. After that, the writer explains why the Indonesian translation is inaccurate and suggests a more accurate translation.

The data collection technique that is used to conduct this research is document analysis because the data are collected by analysing documents that contain inaccurate Indonesian translations. The documents analyzed are the inaccurate Indonesian auto-generated subtitle of the YouTube video entitled "Why Indonesia is always Erupting".

The data analysis technique that the researcher uses to conduct this research is the qualitative technique. Lodico et al. (2010) conclude that in all qualitative studies, data analysis, and continuous interpretation throughout the study so that knowledge gained in initial data analysis can guide future data collection. Meanwhile, Ary et al. (2009) conclude that a qualitative researcher must organize and categorize or encode large volumes of data so that it can be described and interpreted.

3. RESULT AND DISCUSSION

There are thirteen problems which are discussed in this section. The thirteen data was shown as an overview of the possible problems occur when using YouTube auto translation. The first data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says:

SL: "It's really this belt right here"

TL: "*Ini benar-benar sabuk ini di sini*".

Johnny is trying to emphasize the belt to the audience by saying 'really' not saying that the belt is real. Therefore, the correct Indonesian subtitle should be "Sabuk ini disini".

The second data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: "Okay let's quickly go over why volcanoes exist"

TL: "*Oke. Mari kita segera membahas mengapa ada gunung berapi*".

Because Johnny is going to explain the audience how volcanoes are formed, it is better to translate the sentence into "*Oke. Mari kita segera membahas bagaimana gunung berapi terbentuk*".

The third data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: "When these plates move into each other, they make mountains"

TL: “*Saat lempeng-lempeng ini saling bergerak, mereka membentuk gunung*”.

In this sentence, Johnny is trying to say that the plates collide into each other. ‘*Saling bergerak*’ means move together in Indonesia which is not what Johnny is trying to say. The correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Saat lempeng-lempeng ini menabrak satu sama lain, mereka membentuk gunung*” because ‘*menabrak*’ means collide/crash.

The fourth data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: “When they spread apart, they make underwater volcanoes”

TL: “*Ketika mereka menyebar, mereka membuat gunung berapi bawah laut*”.

Johnny is talking about earth plates which will be more suitable if ‘spread apart’ is translated to ‘*berpisah*’. The correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Ketika mereka berpisah, mereka membuat gunung berapi bawah laut*”.

The fifth data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: “That cool and turn into rocks and we call them islands”

TL: “*Yang mendingin dan berubah menjadi bebatuan dan kita menyebutnya pulau*”

The correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Yang mendingin dan berubah menjadi bebatuan yang kita sebut pulau.*” Excessive use of ‘*dan*’ is not good, therefore it will be better to change the structure of the sentence to make it more readable.

The sixth data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: “Are villages where tons of people live”

TL: “*Adalah desa tempat tinggal berton-ton orang*”.

According to the context, tons refer to the amount of people, not the weight of the people. The correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Adalah desa tempat tinggal banyak orang*”.

The seventh data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: “But it’s not the lava that kills them. It’s the ash”

TL: “*Tetapi bukan lahar yang membunuh mereka. Itu abu*”.

Those two sentences are connected, therefore, it is better to use ‘*melainkan*’ instead of ‘*itu*’ to maintain the connection between the two sentences. The correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Tetapi bukan lahar yang membunuh mereka. Melainkan abu*”.

The eighth data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: “If you were standing in the way of one of these massive ash avalanches, you will die”

TL: “*Jika Anda menghalangi salah satu longsoran abu besar ini, Anda akan mati*”.

In Indonesia, ‘*menghalangi*’ implies that someone has an intention of stopping something which is not what Johnny is trying to imply. He is trying to imply that if someone is in the way of the massive ash avalanches, they will die. Therefore, the correct Indonesian subtitle should be ‘*Jika Anda berada di jalan salah satu longsoran abu besar ini. Anda akan mati.*’

The ninth data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny’s friend Christian says

SL: “And with me here the bad-ass, hardworking dude”

TL: “*Dan dengan saya di sini adalah orang-orang nakal, pekerja keras*”.

The people he is referring to are the people who put their lives and health at stake just to make ends meet. It is appropriate to translate ‘bad-ass’ to ‘*orang-orang pemberani*’. Therefore, the

correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Dan dengan saya di sini adalah orang-orang pemberani, pekerja keras*”.

The tenth data of inaccurate translation is when Christian says

SL: “I just tried 40. I could barely manage it”

TL: “*Saya baru mencoba 40. Saya hampir tidak bisa mengaturnya*”.

He is trying to lift a 40 kg of sulfur and he can barely make it. So the correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Saya baru mencoba 40 Saya hampir tidak bisa melakukannya*”.

The eleventh data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: “And these are all the villages right up against it”

TL: “*Dan ini adalah semua desa yang menentang*”.

During this sentence, Johnny is showing the villages that are located right on top of the mountain. So, the correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Dan ini adalah semua desa yang tepat berada di atasnya*.”

The twelfth data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: “The neighboring volcano is also deeply symbolic”

TL: “*Gunung berapi tetangga juga sangat simbolis*”

In Indonesia, the term ‘*tetangga*’ is used to refer to people only. Therefore, the correct Indonesian subtitle should be “*Gunung berapi di sampingnya juga sangat simbolis*”.

The thirteenth data of inaccurate translation is when Johnny says

SL: “And my goal is to go to Indonesia with my camera”

TL: “*Dan tujuan saya adalah pergi ke Indonesia dengan kamera saya*”.

In this sentence, Johnny is telling his dreams and wishes for the future to the audience. The correct Indonesian translation should be ‘*Dan mimpi saya adalah pergi ke Indonesia dengan kamera saya*’ because the term ‘*tujuan*’ means ‘purpose’ which is not what Johnny is trying to say.

4. CONCLUSION

While the auto-generated subtitle feature provided by YouTube is a great help for people who do not speak the language, it still needs improvements. The aforementioned data in the result and discussion proves that the auto-generated subtitle still makes mistakes in transferring the source language meaning to the target language.

The mistakes created by the auto-generated subtitle feature provided by YouTube are because the feature only uses literal translation technique which ignores the context of the sentence. That makes the subtitles created by the auto-generated subtitle inaccurate because literal translation is known for its inability to transfer the intended meaning from source language to target language.

The researcher hopes that this research can be used as a reference for future studies concerning the auto-generated subtitle feature provided by YouTube. This research also acts as a criticism for YouTube companies so that they keep improving the features they offer, in this case, the auto-generated subtitle.

5. REFERENCE

- Alcina, A. 2008. "Translation Technologies: Scope, Tools, and Resources". *Target*, 20(1), 79-102.
- Ary, Donald, Lucy Cheser Jacobs, and Chris Sorensen. 2009. *Introduction to Research in Education*. 8th ed. Cengage Learning.
- Fauliyah, Siti. 2012. "Translation of Address Term in Ketika Cinta Bertasbih II (Indonesian-English Subtitle)." *Journal Unair* 1(2).
- Fitria, Tira Nur. 2015. "Translation Technique of English to Indonesia Subtitle in Doraemon 'Stand by Me' Movie." Muhammadiyah University of Surakarta, Surakarta.
- Gustin, Rr, and Zora Aveline. 2015. *Subtitling Strategies and Translation Readability of the Indonesia Subtitle of Maleficent Movie*.
- Hutchins, W. J., & Somers, H. L. 1992. *An introduction to machine translation*. London: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich.
- Karamitraoglou, Fotios. 2000. *Towards the Methodology for the Investigation of Norms in Audiovisual Translation*. Amsterdam: Rodopi.
- Lodico, Marguerite G., Dean T. Spaulding, and Katherine H. Voegtle. 2010. *Methods in Educational Research: From Theory to Practice, 2nd Edition*. 2nd ed. John Wiley & Sons.